THE GENESIS AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE
“SCIENCE OF SIMILARITIES” IN THE QUR’AN: A
REFLECTION OF THE ROLE OF AL-GHERNATY AND
FADHIL AL-SAMARRA’I

M. Y. Zulkifli bin Haji Mohd Yusoff
Mohamed Ragaie Ahmed Elgebaly

AL-GHERNATY’S CONTRIBUTIONS IN THE SCIENCE OF
“SIMILARITIES IN THE HOLY QUR’AN”

Al-Ghernaty’s book “Malak al-Ta’wil al-Qati’ bi Zawi al-Elhad wa al-ta’til fi Tawjih al-mutashabib al-Lafzy min Aay al-Tanzil,” is seen as a primary source in the field of similarities in the Qur’an. Said al-Falah, the editor of the book, says that “this book might be the most fulfilling, simple and the best of all that have been written on similarity in the Qur’an.” It has even exceeded the two most popular books written in that field: ‘Durrat al-Tanzil’ by al-Khatib al-Eskafy and ‘al-Burhan’ by al-Karmany. It seems that no other book is as good as al-Ghernaty’s ever since has been published with an exception with some books of al-Samarra’i who managed to come up with significant analytical results.

AL-GHERNATY’S BIOGRAPHY AND FAMILY BACKGROUND

Al-Ghernaty’s full name is known as “ibn al-Zubair, abu Ja’far, Ahmad bin Ibrahim bin al-Zubair bin Mohammad bin Ibrahim bin al-Zubair bin Asim (al-Asimy, al-Thaqafy, al-Gernaty) al-Imam al-Hafiz, the master of Qur’an reciters and narrators of Hadith in Andalusia.” He was born in Jayyan, a city in the east of Cordoba, in Zul-Qi’dah/September in 627 or 626 A.H./1230 C.E. He was one of the Arab emigrants to Andalusia. He was born in Jayyan, a city in the east of Cordoba, in Zul-Qi’dah/September in 627 or 626 A.H./1230 C.E. He was one of the Arab emigrants to Andalusia. He became a famous scholar and had been able to make a great deal of wealth. He left Andalusia

---

2 His grandfather’s name by which he was known more than his name.
3 Al-Asimī: his 8th grandfather’s name & al-Thaqafy: the tribe of Banī Thaqīf, his last grandfather’s tribe & al-Ghernaty: the city of Granada where he settled and became one of its renowned scholars. See: al-Ghernaty, Malak al-Ta’wil, p. 61.
5 By al-Falah, the editor of ‘Malak al-Ta’wil’, v. 1, p. 6.
when it fell in the hands of enemies in 643 A.H. but he was able to manage to further his studies and to achieve his scholarship by the dint of the legacy left by his father. However, he passed away in Granada in the 8 Rabī’ al-Awwal/January in 708 A.H. and hundreds of people had attended to his funeral.

The Main Objectives of ‘Malak al-Ta’wil’
Al-Ghernaty’s ‘Malak al-Ta’wil’ is paid great attention nowadays more than any other book on “similarity in the Qur’an”. It is no wonder that his book has become so popular due to the high quality of its content and to its antiquity. The main objectives of this book are as following:

1. To respond to the atheists and other groups that deviated from Islam and who were offensive to the Qur’an assuming that it contains faulty aspects. This aim is reflected even in the title of the book. Though this seems the main intention of the author in this book, there are some other objectives of the book as well.

2. To highlight the importance of the science of the “similarity in the Qur’an” in the context that there is an academic gap and lack of enough writings on this subject as it so far did not receive much attention of the Muslim scholars. Ibn al-Zubair claims that “It is among the subjects that our scholars in the field of the Qur’anic studies seem too reluctant to write on the issue of similarity in the Qur’an”. Ibn al-Zubair claims that he was the first to write on this subject except for al-Iskafi’s book ‘Durrat al-Tanzil wa Ghurrat al-Ta’wil’. However, it seems that Ibn al-Zubair was not introduced to al-Kermani’s book ‘al-Burhan fi Tawjih Mutashabih al-Qur’an’.

3. To controvert repetition in the Qur’an. Ibn al-Zubair points out “It is improper for similar Qur’anic verses to be considered as repetition. Every verse that is similar to another is unique and may not be replaced with its counter verse no matter the degree of similarity.”. He adds “therefore, there is no repetition in the Qur’an. Every Qur’anic verse introduces something new that is adequate to the theme of its context and which has not been introduced by its
counter verse”\textsuperscript{10}.

4. To serve the Book of God, the Qur’an, saving no efforts to do so. Ibn al-Zubair says: “The Qur’an is the most important book that deserves much attention and to sacrifice time for it”\textsuperscript{11}.

**Al-Ghernaty’s Methodology in Studying and Directing Similarities in the Qur’an**

1. Al-Ghernaty’s methodology does not differ from the methodology adopted by interpreters of the Qur’an. Like others, he adopted the same order in approaching the suras (chapters) in the Qur’an as well as the same verses within the same Sura. He started with Surat al-Fatiha analyzing every verse, then al-Baqara and until the end of the Qur’an.

2. He studied the verses analyzed by al-Iskafi and pointed out the verses he missed out signaling them with the Arabic letter (غ/gh). Ibn al-Zubair says: “I relied on al-Iskafi’s analysis of the Qur’anic verses pointing out what he forgot and which was not mentioned in his book ‘Dorat al-Tanzil’ marking those verses with the Arabic letter (غ/gh)”\textsuperscript{12}.

3. He dealt with the similar verses in the Qur’an by introducing his analysis first, then representing what al-Iskafi wrote on them. He illustrates that saying, “I analyzed the similar verses without referring back to al-Iskafi in almost all verses. I did not either copy what linguists wrote except for rare obscure meanings only after I have mentioned what came to my mind first and what Allah has allowed for me to understand and wrote down”\textsuperscript{13}. This methodology in research is considered as “a principle in contemporary research which drives away the researcher from being affected by others thoughts. It encourages him to free up his mind before conducting any research in order to reflect his own views and ideas”\textsuperscript{14}.

4. He used two methods in dealing with similar verses in the Qur’an: firstly, analytical and then comparative. These two methods were adopted by al-Iskafi who used to carefully analyze the words of

similar verses using Arabic dictionaries, grammars and rhetoric. He then compares between these verses according to their context (i.e., the Qur’anic verse/verses and the sometimes the whole Sura). Doing so, Ibn al-Zubair does not aim at prioritizing one verse upon another, but he intends to point out the reasons behind revealing each verse and to explore what each word is meant. According to him, every word in the Quran is distinctive and one may not be substitute for others.

5. He studied every similar verse in each Sura in an order of the main verse first then the other verses resembling it. Then, he discusses the aspects of similarity and diversity and the reasons and causes behind it in the form of questions (usually one, two or more questions). After presenting all the questions he answered them one by one.

The Main Features of al-Gernaty’s Style in Directing similarities in the Qur’an

1. Adopting an Argumentative and Interactive Style of Writing:

   In his book, Ibn al-Zubair adopted an argumentative and interactive style as like as al-Iskafi what he adopted in his book ‘al-Dora’. Both of them realized the influence and effectiveness of this style on the reader. The style is based on suspense which attracts the reader. This style is one of those styles used by the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) while teaching his companions (R.A.A).

2. Linguistic Interpretation (Lexical, grammar and rhetoric):

   It seems that Al-Ghernaty depends greatly on linguistic interpretation when he compares and contrasts between the similar verses in the Qur’an. It can be said that this style could commonly be traced throughout his book.

3. Context Employment in the Interpretation of similarities:

   Despite of his profound dependence on linguistic aspects, al-Ghernaty focuses more on the context and considers it as an essential for his interpretation. Thus, an interpretation attributed to him rarely goes without referring to its own context. In other words: “he showed a great interest in representing the significance of the Qur’an through similar verses. He looked into the context of the verse, its structure and vocabulary then linked it all with the verse. Sometimes, he investigates the whole Sura in order to explain the relationship between the meaning and the structure.”

---

15 Al-Shethry, Sālih Abdullah Muhammad, 1421 A.H./2001 C.E., al-Mutashabih al-Lafzī
4. Elaboration in details:

   Elaboration was one of the salient features in al-Ghernaty’s approach in writing which may be rarely found in other scholars’ writings on the issue of similarity in the Qur’an. Though al-İskafi became famous for his elaboration, Ibn al-Zubair provided much more lengthy explanations and for this he was attributed by al-Shethry as ‘a man full of patience’16.

5. Drilling deep into explanations:

   To illustrate his points of view, al-Ghernaty went into detailed explanation of juristic, theological, grammatical and linguistic implications. His attention to grammar and linguistics may be due to his interest in them. Although the grammatical issues in his book ‘al-Malak’ were almost the dominant one but there were many theological issues as well. At the beginning of Sura al-Mu‘minin, al-Ghernaty answers the first question saying: “The answer for the first question is that the protection of progeny is one of the five foundations of faith agreed on by all religions and not objected by mature individuals. These five foundations are: the protection of soul, wealth, progeny, mind and honor17.

6. Quotations from Hadith:

   Ibn al-Zubair was known for his quotes from Hadith more than the other scholars. His book obviously reflects this as it is likely to find every two pages or less a translation of the Qur’an, a poetry or a prose.

7. Referring to grammarians, interpreters and theologians.

   Al-Ghernaty refers to many renowned linguists and interpreters in order to trace the authentic opinion. When he quotes, he used to criticize rather than mere quoting. He used to present points of view one by one and criticize them positively or negatively. He has been very critical to atheists and their invalid interpretations. He directed his pen for the truth and so the main purpose of his book was to refute their dubieties.

---

17 Al-Ghernaty, Malak al-Ta‘wil, edited by: Abdel-Ghanî Muhammad al-Fâsî, v. 2, p. 365. Muslim scholars have put these in another order as was mentioned in the explanation of the poetry on jurisprudence rules (Manzumat al-Qawil al-Fiğhil): “Religion comes first, then, the soul, the mind, the offspring and finally the wealth”, p. 64.
8. **Personality reflections:**

In *Malak al-Ta’wil*, al-Ghernaty’s personality is strongly presented. However, this presence is not that much that might cause boredom to the reader. Such a character may not be achieved by many and therefore it is considered one of the main features of al-Ghernaty’s book.

---

**THE ROLE OF FADHIL AL-SAMARRA’I IN REVIVING THE SCIENCE OF SIMILARITIES IN THE HOLY QUR’AN**

The Arab and Muslim world have known Fadhil Al-Samarra’i through his popular program “*Lamasāt Bayāniyya*” shown on Sharjah TV. The program was widely watched by Muslim society. Al-Samarra’i became popular and his fans used to wait in interest for his program to watch on Mondays and Thursdays every week at 9:40 PM (Sharjah time-zone).

**Al-Samarra’i’s Biography and Family Background**

Al-Samarra’i is known as “Abu Muhammad, Fadhil bin Salih bin Mahdi bin Khalil al-Badri (from ‘al-Badri’ tribe in the city of Samarra’). He was born in 1933 in Samarra’. He was brought up in a religious prestigious house with an average income. He was admitted to the Quran learning course at Hasan Basha Mosque (one of the mosques in Samarra’) in his early age. He then memorized the whole Qur’an in a short period of time showing sharp intelligence. Al-Samarra’i was seen as a prominent scholar admired by the people of Samarra’. His biography is found on many websites such as: wikipedia. He held many positions in a number of educational institutions which we will come across in brief, in addition to his educational background:

1. In 1957, al-Samarra’i got admitted in Dar al-Mu’allimīn al-Alia to further his bachelor degree at the Faculty of Education, Department of Arabic language. He graduated in 1960-1961 and got his BA degree with honors.

2. He completed his Masters in Literature and Linguistics. In the same year, he was appointed as a lecturer at the Faculty of Education, Baghdad University.

3. He received his PhD degree in 1968 from Ain Shams University, Faculty of Literature, Department of Arabic Language.

---


4. After merging the faculty of Education with the Faculty of Literature, he was appointed as a Professor at the Faculty of Literature, Baghdad University.

5. In 1979, he taught at Kuwait University in the Department of Arabic language as part of a lecturer exchange program between Kuwait University and Baghdad University.

6. In 1983, he was appointed as an expert in the committee of assets in the Iraqi Academy of Sciences.

7. In 1996, he was appointed as an active member in the Iraqi Academy of sciences.

8. He went to UAE and worked as a Professor at Ajman university for a year. Then, he was appointed at Sharjah University where he taught Arabic grammar and Qur’an locution from 1999 until the Summer of 2004. He returned to Iraq and gave lectures once more at Baghdad University.

**Al-Samarra’i’s Methodology in Dealing with Similarity in the Qur’an**

Al-Samarra’i applied two methodologies in dealing with similarities in the Qur’an:

1. In his books named ‘*As’ila Bayania fi al-Qur’an al-Karīm* (our case study) and ‘*Lamasāt Bayānia fi Nusūs min al-Tanzīl*, al-Samarra’i followed the same methodology of traditional scholars. He adapted the same order of the *Suras* in the Qur’an and the verses of the *Suras*. However, he did not examine all the similar verses in each Sura in separate. Instead, he grouped the similar verses topically and organized according to the order of the *Suras* and verses.

2. Al-Samarra’i also used a different methodology in dealing with similar Qur’anic verses. He grouped the similar verses into sections, each section deals with a specific subject such as addition and deletion, foregrounding and backgrounding and other linguistic issues. This methodology is used in two of his books entitled: ‘*al-Ta’bīr al-Qur’ānī* and ‘*Balaghat al-Kalima fi al-Ta’bīr al-Qur’ānī*.

**Al-Samarra’i’s Approaches in Dealing with Similarity in the Qur’an**

There are two approaches adapted by Al-Samarra’i in dealing with “similar verses of the Quran: contextual and linguistics.
1. **Contextual**

In an interview, when al-Samarra’i was asked about his overwhelming focus on contextual dimension in analyzing the similar Qur’anic verses, he replied “yes, it is true and it is because the context is the medium which directs the intended meaning of similar verses. It is the main tool to discover the correct meanings of similar Qur’anic verses”. Thus, a reader of al-Samarra’i can easily realize this reality throughout his writings concerned. Apparently, the contextual analysis is not only tool that the author adapted, yet, there are some other approaches could be seen in his writings. He himself asserts in this regard, “Before giving examples, I would like to make it clear that when a certain expression is examined, there are many aspects involved: The context where the expression appears, the Sura, the other contexts where similar expressions appear and the other *Suras* where similar or different expressions appear. In other words, in order to examine one expression we need to examine all the other similar or different expressions in the Qur’ān”\(^\text{20}\).

2. **Language, Grammar and Rhetoric**

Linguistic, Grammatical and Rhetoric aspects of analysis are some other tools that are popularly used by al-Samarra’i in dealing with similar Qur’anic verses. The author mentions this at the end of his introduction to ‘Balaghāt al-Kalima’ “finally, it is important to point out that in my analysis of similar verses in the Qur’ān I used to depend on linguistic tools and the context to examine the differences in usage. This approach is may be very important in pointing out the reason behind the selection of similar verses each where they occur.”\(^\text{21}\).

**General Characteristics of al-Samarra’i’s Style in Dealing with Similarity in the Qur’ān**

1. **Simple and Excellent Style of Writing:** In his writings, al-Samarra’i used simple style of writing that could be easily understood by the reader, far from complexity and redundancy. He often involves the reader in the discussion which leaves a significant impact on the receivers who are given a chance to be part of the discussion.

2. **Moderate Elaboration:** al-Samarra’i adopts a moderate style in

---


elaborating linguistic issues when he examines similar Qur’anic verses. However, his explanations are sometimes long but interesting.

3. **Frequent Quoting from the Qur’an:** This could be due to al-Samarra’i’s adaptation of context in dealing with similar Qur’anic verses in order to provide evidence on his understanding.

4. **Diversity of Styles Between narration and discussion:** Al-Samarra’i used two styles of writing to present a topic:

   a. **Narration:** This style is clearly shown in two of his books namely: ‘al-Ta’bīr al-Qur’ānī’ and ‘Balaghat al-Kalima’. He introduces the similar verses in the Qur’an then he examines and analyzes them in details.

   b. **Discussion:** In this style, al-Samarra’i introduces the similar Qur’anic verses followed by a group of questions which are answered by him one by one. For example, the style adopted in his book ‘As’ila Bayānia fi al-Qur’an al-Karīm’. This style is not a unique in al-Samarra’i but before him there are some other like al-Khaṭīb al-Iskāfī, al-Ghirnaty and ibn Jamā’a adopted it.

5. **Influence by Former Scholars:** an explorer in al-Samarra’i’s books may affirm that he was not much influenced by early scholars’ writings on similarity in the Qur’an. On the contrary, such an influence is found in al-Ghirnaty’s book ‘Malāk al-Ta’wīl’, al-Kirmānī’s ‘al-Burhān’, al-Iskāfī’s ‘al-Durra’, al-Razī’s ‘A’lām al-Tafsīr’, al-Shawkānī’s and al-Zamakhsharī’s.

6. **Making use of Other Islamic Sciences than Tafsīr:** al-Samarra’i sometimes makes use of some Islamic sciences other than tafsīr such as qirāʾāt (readings of the Qur’an) and jurisprudence. For instance, he points out in his book ‘Balāghat al-Kalima’ the principles of the correct reading of the Qur’an on which he depended in examining similar Qur’anic verses set by Ibn al-Jazarī:

   The principles of the valid reading are three: a verified narration, one that agrees with Othman’s copy of the Qur’an and with the rules of Arabic language. Thus, if one of these principles is missed out, the reading is said to be weak, invalid or odd be it among the seven valid readings, ten or even above that. This is the method used

---

7. **Critique of Previous Works:** In his books, al-Samarra’i criticizes some Qur’anic interpreters and linguists’ views regarding similarity in the Qur’an. However, he builds his criticism on strong basis and persuasive evidence.

The Role of al-Samarra’i in Reviving the Science of Similarity in the Qur’an

1. **Individualizing the Issues:** Al-Samarra’i generally deals with each issue in separate manner. Yet, very rarely, he deals with a couple of issues at a time. For example, in his book ‘Wasa’il Bayāniyya’ he discusses seventy one locations of similar verses in the Qur’an. At every location he discussed one issue except for six locations of which five of them he discussed under two categories.

2. **General Introduction:** Al-Samarra’i usually gives a general introduction to the issue he discusses. For instance, his introduction to the issue of foregrounding as he says: “… and this foregrounding usually indicates specificity”.24

3. **Elaborative Style:** One of the most salient features in al-Samarra’i’s methodology in dealing with similarity in the Qur’an is his linguistic and grammatical elaboration. Although this feature was clear in the writings of some of the old linguists who dealt with similarity in the Qur’an, but it is more explicit in al-Samarra’i’s. He places it at the beginning before setting examples.

4. **Generalization:** Al-Samarra’i has generalized some rules for dealing with similarity in the Qur’an which is considerably a new method. Yāsīn al-Majīd25 and al-Samarra’i26 have paid their attention to this method in their related books many.

---

### A COMPARISON BETWEEN AL-GHERNATY AND AL-SAMARRA’I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Comparison variables</th>
<th>Al-Ghernaty</th>
<th>Al-Samarra’i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The language</td>
<td>The language of al Ghernaty is easy.</td>
<td>Al Samarra’i’s language easier and more visible and closer to understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>use of rhetoric in expression.</td>
<td>commonly using methods of rhetoric.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dialogue with the reader making it an attractive style.</td>
<td>Using narrative style more than the dialogue with the reader.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The basis of guidance</td>
<td>Consideration and meditation in the context.</td>
<td>Consideration and meditation in the context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dependence on the science of language: syntax, morphology and rhetoric.</td>
<td>Dependence on the science of language: syntax, morphology and rhetoric.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Detailing the issue</td>
<td>Extend in details</td>
<td>moderate in brevity and extension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Sciences that have been sourced</td>
<td>Linguistics and rhetoric science.</td>
<td>Linguistics and rhetoric science.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Interpretation books.</td>
<td>Interpretation books.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Science of Holy Qur’an</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Science of Hadith.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Science of speech.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 5 | Critique to the former scholars | He is a skilled critic. He does not transfer the views as it is, but contemplates and may accept, reply on or edit it. This character has emerged at Al-Ghernaty. | He is a skilled critic but the lack of transferring quotation did not clearly disclose this capacity. |

| 6 | Quotation                     | The large number of transferring and quotation | The lack of transferring and quotation |

| 7 | Innovation and renewal       | He combines the traditional approach of his professor Al-Eskafi and the innovation and renewal he developed. | His innovation and renewal than Al-Ghernaty. He innovated a new approach and interpreted many verses that had never been interpreted. |
The Genesis and Development of The “Science of Similarities” in The Qur’an: A Reflection of The Role of al-Ghernaty and Fadhl Al-Samarra’i

| 8 | Influence on the later scholars | The influence of Al-Ghernaty is notable on all who came after as well as Al Samarra’i and all modern. All books of Similarities have the impact of Al-Ghernaty and quoted him and take advantage of it. His book “Malak al-Ta’weel” considers as a major work in “Similarities in Holy Qur’an.” | Al Samarra’i has been influenced by his forerunners and quoted them. His citation of the earlier scholars in “similarities” is little. Al-Ghernaty is popularly quoted. |

CONCLUSION

To conclude, this study finds Al-Ghernaty as the pioneer in the issue of “similarity in the Qur’an.” His book ‘Malak al-Ta’wil’ is attributed to simplicity, comprehensiveness and originality. In the present time, this valuable book has been able to draw the attention of many scholars and linguists. The reason behind this attention may be its contributing role in promoting this subject as a kind of science of “similarities in the Qur’an”. Perhaps, it is difficult to find out a rather similar work up to the date. However, al-Samarra’i also played an essential role in reviving this science after it has been relatively neglected by linguists over thousand years. Al-Samarra’i’s contributions in this connection go beyond the scope of al-Ghernaty’s. Yet, a clear influence of al-Ghernaty’s works in his works is explicitly reflected, especially in methodology and central thesis. It may be significant to approach the science of similarity in the Qur’an within a new context so that it can be useful in developing a particular genre of Quranic understanding.
REFERENCES


http://ar.wikipedia.org/wiki


